

An International Conference/Workshop at Yale University

# MUSLIM MEN

ON LOVE, NURTURANCE, CARE, AND FULFILLMENT



Photo: Nefissa Naguib

Yale University | April 14-17, 2016

The Edward J. and Dorothy Clarke Kempf Memorial Fund and the  
Council for Middle East Studies at the MacMillan Center for International and Area Studies

The Edward J. and Dorothy Clarke Kempf Memorial Fund  
and the Council for Middle East Studies at the  
MacMillan Center for International and Area Studies



**MUSLIM MEN**  
ON LOVE, NURTURANCE, CARE, AND FULFILLMENT  
An International Conference/Workshop at Yale University  
April 14 - 17, 2016

Organized by  
Marcia C. Inhorn  
Yale University

In Collaboration with  
Nefissa Naguib  
University of Oslo

## CONFERENCE SCHEDULE OF EVENTS

### THURSDAY APRIL 14

6PM, Meet in Hotel Lobby for Walk to Restaurant

Courtyard New Haven Hotel, 30 Whalley Avenue, New Haven, CT

6:30-9PM, Conference Welcome Dinner

Barcelona Restaurant, 155 Temple Street, New Haven, CT

### FRIDAY APRIL 15

8:30-9AM, Breakfast

Luce Hall Common Room, 34 Hillhouse Avenue, New Haven, CT

9-9:15AM, Introduction and Welcome, Marcia Inhorn & Nefissa Naguib

Luce Hall Room 203, 34 Hillhouse Avenue, New Haven, CT

Open Sessions

Luce Hall Room 203, 34 Hillhouse Avenue, New Haven, CT

#### Muslim Middle East

9:15-9:45AM, "Gender Troubles in Shatila, Lebanon: Bodies that Matter (the *Fidā'iyīns* Heroism) and Undoing Gender (the *Shabāb's* Burden)", Gustavo Barbosa

9:45-10:15AM, "Teaching Him to Care: Labor, Providing, and the Making of Men in Urban Egypt", Farha Ghannam

10:15-10:45AM, "A Man in Love – Masculinity, Marriage and Conjugal Connectivity in Urban Egypt", Mari Norbakk

10:45-11:15AM, "Men as Refuge-Granters, Doting Family Members, and Romantics: Emerging Masculinities in Iraqi Kurdistan", Diane King

11:15-11:45AM, "Shaping a 'Different' Masculinity: Subjectivity, Agency and Cultural Idioms among Afghan Pashtun Men", Andrea Chioyenda

12-1:00PM, Lunch

Luce Hall Common Room, 34 Hillhouse Avenue, New Haven, CT

#### Muslim Asia and Africa

1:00-1:30PM, "Am I Muslim or Just Kazakh? Politics of Care in Postsocialist Kazakhstan", Aina Begim

1:30-2PM, "From Soft Patriarch to Companionate Partner: Muslim Masculinity in Java since the 'New Order'", Nancy Smith-Hefner

2-2:30PM, "Cosmopolitan Indian Masculinities and Polycystic Ovary Syndrome: Case Studies that Lead Us to Reconsider Gender Relations in Contemporary Urban India", Gauri Pathak

2:30-3PM, "'And What Will Our Children Eat?' Dispossession and Food Security Concerns among Muslim Makonde Men on the Swahili Coast, Tanzania", Vinay Kamat

3-3:30PM, "General Tarzan the Coach: Humanitarian Detours in the Career of a Central African Man-in-Arms", Louisa Lombard

3:30-3:45PM, Coffee Break

Luce Hall Common Room, 34 Hillhouse Avenue, New Haven, CT

#### Muslim Diasporas

3:45-4:15PM, "Brothers in Islam: Faith, Love and Care among Muslim Men in Brazil", Gisele Fonseca Chagas

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

---

4:15-4:45PM, "‘We Take Care of Our Sons’: Love, Care and Companionship among Muslim Men Engaged in *Da’wa* Activities in Barcelona, Spain", Guillermo Martín-Sáiz

4:45-5:15PM, "Ghassal Ghurbat: Solidarity, Respect, and Devotion among Muslim Men Caring for the Migrant Dead in Greece", Tina Palivos

5:15-5:45PM, "Spring Comes Late: Syrian Refugee Fathers Above the Arctic Circle", Nefissa Naguib

5:45-6:15PM, "Searching for Love and Test-tube Babies: Arab Refugee Men in Reproductive Exile on the Margins of Detroit", Marcia Inhorn

6:30-9PM, Dinner

Caseus Fromagerie & Bistro, 93 Whitney Avenue, New Haven, CT

## **SATURDAY APRIL 16**

8:30-9AM, Breakfast

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

Closed Sessions

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

9-9:45AM, Barbosa

9:45-10:30AM, Ghannam

10:30-11:15AM, Norbakk

11:15-11:30AM, Coffee Break

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

11:30-12:15PM, King

12:15-1PM, Chiovenda

1-2PM, Lunch

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

2-2:45PM, Begim

2:45-3:30PM, Smith-Hefner

3:30-4:15PM, Pathak

4:15-5PM, Kamat

6-9PM, Dinner

Marcia's Home

## **SUNDAY APRIL 17**

8:30-9 AM, Breakfast

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

Closed Sessions Ctd.

9-9:45AM, Lombard

9:45-10:30AM, Chagas

10:30-11:15PM, Martin-Saiz

11:15-12PM, Palivos

12-1PM, Lunch

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

1-1:45PM, Naguib

1:45-2:30PM, Inhorn

2:30-3, Conference Wrap-Up and Publication Plans

Anthropology Department Room 105, 10 Sachem Street, New Haven, CT

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

---

## ABSTRACTS

### **Gender Troubles in Shatila, Lebanon: Bodies that Matter (the *Fidā'īyyīn*'s Heroism) and Undoing Gender (the *Shabāb*'s Burden)**

Gustavo Barbosa

London School of Economics and Political Science

This paper asks how today's lads (*shabāb*) from the Shatila Palestinian Refugee Camp, in the southern suburbs of Beirut, Lebanon, come of age and display gender belonging. In Palestine prior to 1948, men came of age by marrying, bearing a son and providing for their families. For the Palestinian diaspora in Lebanon, throughout the 1970s, acting as a *fidā'ī* (fighter) worked as an alternative mechanism for coming of age and displaying gender belonging. Currently, however, both the economic and political-military avenues have ceased to be options open for the Shatila *shabāb*. I register the differences between the *fidā'īyyīn* and their offspring, the *shabāb*, in their coming of age and gender display. While the *fidā'īyyīn* bore pure agency - understood as resistance to domination - and displayed their maturity through the fight to return to their homeland, their offspring have a more nuanced relation to Palestine and articulate their coming of age and gender belonging in different ways, such as building a house, attempting to get married and starting a family. By observing how the *shabāb* do their gender, it is not only the full historicity and changeability in time and space of masculinity that come to the fore, but also the scholarly concept of gender that can be transformed and undone. Indeed, defining gender strictly in terms of power and relations of domination fails to grasp the experiences of those, like the Shatila *shabāb*, with very limited access to power - a lesson to be learned by those studying gender in the Middle East and beyond.

### **Teaching Him to Care: Labor, Providing, and the Making of Men in Urban Egypt**

Farha Ghannam

Swarthmore College

Muslim men and women are often assumed to inhabit different spaces and have their own separate domains. Lost in these assumptions are the flows of affective connections and the ethic of care that bind men and women and shape their practices in a strong and effective way. Drawing on ethnographic research in a low-income neighborhood in northern Cairo and recent studies of affect and gender, this paper looks at notions of care and how they are materialized in emotional bonds and concrete engagements. In particular, the paper looks at how young boys are taught a gendered ethic of care that connect them to older and younger male and female members of their family and community. Starting by looking at how a young boy is taught about labor, money, sharing, and responsibility, the analysis pays particular attention to the affective bond and reciprocity embedded in the interaction between this boy and people around him, including his younger sister. The paper then compares several cases of caring and loving boys and men with other men who neglect their families and fail to provide for their children and spouses and account for the social reactions to their conduct. Through these cases, the discussion emphasizes that the category of men includes a diverse set of individuals who are capable of creating multiple

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

---

identifications, engaging in different modes of action, and generating connections and emotional attachments in various ways. The paper concludes by considering how to account for the ethics of care that connect men and women without losing sight of the gendered norms and patriarchal values that are being reproduced in the process.

### **A Man in Love – Masculinity, Marriage and Conjugal Connectivity in Urban Egypt**

Mari Norbakk

University of Bergen

This paper is about how young middle class men in Cairo talk about their future spouse. Marriage is central to manhood and conceptions of masculinity in Cairo; therefore, “conjugal connectivity” and love become central aspects of young middle class men’s masculinity practices. Drawing from my ethnography in Cairo, I will discuss how my interlocutors present ideas and ideals of love. In their discussions of love, and their expressed hopes and desires for the future, they present their ideals of femininity, womanhood, as well as manhood and masculinity. The paper also argues that through a strong focus on love, men (and women) “bargain with patriarchy”. As the young couples set up new homes away from their families, and buy the necessary stuff of marriage, the patriarchal structure in Cairo’s middle class changes. I attempt to demonstrate how men’s ideas of love are linked to their process of becoming men. The basis for my understanding of masculinity is to view it as a situational, relative and interactional phenomenon. This framework is heavily influenced by G.H. Mead’s interactionist view of persons, in which the self is a social process. This I take to mean that one can study men becoming men through looking at how they interact with their close surroundings, and this is where love becomes central to the masculinity processes of my interlocutors. In Inhorn’s work on men in the Middle East she formulates the concept of conjugal connectivity, and in my work I employ this concept to point at how men become men in relation to their partner, particularly through looking at their ideas of love.

### **Men as Refuge-Granters, Doting Family Members, and Romantics: Emerging Masculinities in Iraqi Kurdistan**

Diane King

University of Kentucky

In this paper, I contextualize portrayals and questions about Kurdish masculinity within the idea of patrilineal descent and the way it can shape gender relations, the formation of bodies politic, and other aspects of social life. In the Kurdistan Region of Iraq, people are accountable to a legal system and a set of moral conventions that privilege male descent. Iraqis can only be born to male Iraqis; a child born in Iraq to a non-Iraqi man, or a woman who cannot or will not identify her child’s father, are not Iraqis. The same membership principle applies to smaller groups such as tribes, which are meaningful social groups for many, and patrilineages, to which every citizen (except wives naturalized by their husbands) belongs. Because patrilineal descent is the only way to enter into a “legitimate” life in Kurdistan, men and women alike may work to ensure paternity by controlling female autonomy promoting a dominant masculinity. In my observation during ethnographic research stints since 1995, men are expected to support the cloistering of women

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

---

and sometimes encouraged to overlook their abuse, and to demonstrate through stoicism or other forms of social distance that they do not “fear” their wives or other female relatives. However, many men depart from these expectations. For example, some men challenge other men who seek to limit the autonomy of women in their households, most dramatically by harboring women who have fled them. Other men have openly shown affection toward and care for their wives, sisters, and daughters, even as they or their observers commented on how their actions were risky or “modern.” Embedded as they are in a larger set of moral and legal codes and behavioral expectations, these masculine innovators may be in the process of bringing significant change to the Kurdistan political order of things.

### **Shaping a ‘Different’ Masculinity: Subjectivity, Agency and Cultural Idioms among Afghan Pashtun Men**

Andrea Chiovenda  
Harvard University

In ethnographic literature and “common wisdom” Pashtun society (both in Afghanistan and Pakistan) has become the prototype for an aggressive, often violent, bellicose and uncompromising social environment. Men represent the main protagonists, and upholders, of this “brutish” world (to paraphrase Thomas Hobbes). While there is certainly truth in this picture, today’s ethnographer must ask himself/herself how much of the emphasis placed on these aspects was due to the fascination and unconscious appeal that the predominantly male ethnographers who worked with Pashtuns felt towards such stereotypically “male” societal features. My own research among Pashtun men in a highly volatile and troubled area of Afghanistan looked through the cracks and interstices of this apparently coherent narrative. The paper that I will present offers ethnographic material from my fieldwork in Nangarhar province to show how individual Pashtun men, far from being simply the implementers of a shared set of cultural idioms for an “aggressive” masculinity, respond idiosyncratically to them and at times reject privately those aspects that clash with a more “tender” and nurturing side of their own subjectivity. Through a psychodynamic, in-depth investigation of the subjective states of a select number of Pashtun men, I will show how these individuals privately strive for a different expression and performance of their own masculinity, one that in their wishes should, for example, leave room for a more egalitarian and tender relationship with their wives, for an understanding of romance and sexual desire more attuned to one’s personal choices, and for a downplaying of cultural idioms of violence and revenge. While these contradictions caused psychological suffering and frustration in my informants, they also represented the foundations for the social and cultural change that my informants, however imperceptibly and unconsciously, promote daily with their public behavior.

## **Am I Muslim or Just Kazakh? Politics of Care in Postsocialist Kazakhstan**

Aina Begim

Yale University

When the Soviet Union collapsed, experts predicted a “resurgence” of Islamic practice in Kazakhstan, an oil-rich state in Central Asia. Twenty five years later, the normative Islamic discourse and practices remain marginal in postsocialist Kazakhstan. While the overwhelming majority of Kazakhs self-identify as Muslims, only 4% of Kazakhs pray and 10% of the Muslim population attend the mosque once a week or more. Low levels of religious practice are frequently explained by Kazakhstan’s socialist past and years of state-sponsored atheism. These explanations largely ignore the rich history of pre-socialist Muslim practices, which were heavily influenced by local pre-Islamic Tengrist beliefs and a nomadic mode of life. These explanations also fail to recognize the authenticity of specifically Kazakh ways of being Muslim. In this paper I make two arguments. First, I argue that Kazakhs approach Islam not as a religious ideology but as an important part of the national tradition and culture. Many Kazakhstanis treat followers of the Islamic piety movement in Kazakhstan with caution, criticizing their practices and dress code as “foreign” and “Arab.” To be a good Muslim in Kazakhstan, they argue, is not about wearing a particular garment. It is about living an ethical life, offering hospitality, respecting elders and ancestors, and not losing sight of “shame” (*uyat*). These values inform domestic Islamic practices and life cycle celebrations. Second, I examine what it means to be a Kazakh Muslim by focusing on urban Kazakh men. I argue that caring and providing for one’s family and helping relatives and extended kin is one of the main ways in which Kazakh men assert and perform their masculinity. I analyze these performances of masculinity in the context of Kazakhstan’s oil boom, which, on the one hand, created fabulous wealth and seemingly endless opportunities, but on the other hand, produced high economic inequality and left hundreds of thousands of men unemployed and unable to provide and care for their families.

## **From Soft Patriarch to Companionate Partner: Muslim Masculinity in Java since the “New Order”**

Nancy J. Smith-Hefner

Boston University

Muslim Javanese comprise approximately 40% of Indonesia’s 210 million Muslims. Although gender and family relations have been the focus of considerable research, studies of masculinity in Muslim Java have been relatively few. In this paper I examine the changing contours and dynamics of masculinity among Muslim Javanese since the fall of Indonesia’s “New Order” government in 1998. The study of contemporary forms of Muslim Javanese masculinity builds on an earlier generation of research conducted during Indonesia’s post-Independence era which demonstrated that Javanese forms of masculinity as experienced within the family were marked by a soft form of patriarchy in which a father was indulgent and loving with his offspring in their early years and became a distant, respected figure in the child’s adolescence. During President Suharto’s New Order (1966-1998), this figure of the firm but loving patriarch was adopted by the state with a decidedly more authoritarian emphasis. More recently, with the spectacular expansion

---

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

in higher education (including education for Muslim women) and the subsequent formation of an expanded Indonesian middle class, new pressures have emerged for Javanese masculinity to assume both more normatively Islamic forms but also a more affectively responsive companionate intimacy. The creative tension between these models of masculinity has resulted in varied and contested styles of manhood and of male gender practices. The general trend is however strikingly clear: Muslim Javanese men today are on the whole far more religiously observant while at the same time more emotionally expressive, conversationally engaged, and supportive of their wives' and daughters' education and employment.

### **Cosmopolitan Indian Masculinities and Polycystic Ovary Syndrome: Case Studies that Lead Us to Reconsider Gender Relations in Contemporary Urban India**

Gauri Pathak

The University of Arizona, Tucson

Polycystic ovary syndrome (PCOS), an endocrine disorder that is the leading cause of female infertility worldwide, affects a growing number of urban middle-class Indian women. With symptoms such as irregular menstruation, subfertility, weight gain, cystic acne, hirsutism, and hair fall, PCOS has outcomes that affect a woman's appearance and her fertility. In India, where marriage and motherhood are normative biographies for women, the syndrome, through its effects on fertility and appearance, poses a challenge to women's traditional roles as wives and mothers. In this paper, I therefore use PCOS as a lens to examine the gendered experiences and relationships of Hindu and Muslim couples within the urban cosmopolitan middle class in contemporary India. I argue that the changing sociocultural landscape of globalizing India has resulted in the emergence of masculinities and gender relations that enable new aspirations and identities among women of this urban class and build resilience in the face of conditions such as PCOS.

### **'And What Will Our Children Eat?' Dispossession and Food Security Concerns among Muslim Makonde Men on the Swahili Coast, Tanzania**

Vinay Kamat

University of British Columbia

Islam has had a long presence on the Swahili coast of East Africa. The Makonde (Wamakonde) people, who live in the coastal villages of rural Mtwara in southeastern Tanzania, are predominantly Muslim. Drawing on ethnographic fieldwork conducted in two large coastal villages in rural Mtwara, this paper examines the villagers' response to dispossession resulting from a natural gas extraction project implemented in their midst. Through life histories and narratives, the paper specifically highlights men's concerns regarding socio-economic and household food security in the context of their experiences of dispossession of their farmlands, which include cash crops such as cashew trees and coconut palms. Men's narratives revealed their consternation regarding the sudden loss of their ancestral farmlands and trees to the gas project, and their narratives were often marked by the rhetorical question: "And what will our children eat?" The paper concludes by making a case for the need to pay attention to the social complexities within

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

---

coastal communities, household dynamics surrounding food security, and the socio-ecological contexts in which extractives projects are implemented.

### **General Tarzan the Coach: Humanitarian Detours in the Career of a Central African Man-in-Arms**

Louisa Lombard

Yale University

The predominantly-Muslim residents of the northeastern Central African Republic (CAR) face a bind. While legally citizens of the country, from the perspective of the government and the mostly-Christian southern population, they are dangerous foreigners. Northeasterners are thus “abandoned” (their term of choice) and feel their only way to strike back against their ignorable position is to play into the dangerousness-fears about them, such as by launching rebellion. In this paper I explore this bind by focusing on the life of General Tarzan, who was born and remains Soumaine Ndodeba in non-military contexts. Soumaine’s life reveals many similarities with what others have diagnosed among “stuck” young men who turn to armed group membership in hopes it will offer them a means of subsistence, and even perhaps success. Much of this literature rightly emphasizes how these young men’s expectations are never met, rising higher in inverse proportion to the likelihood they will be fulfilled, and how the rebellion-threat has become a kind of cruel optimism. However, rebellion is also a source of detours, of opportunities different from what rebel group members may once have imagined, primarily proffered by the humanitarian and international agencies that arrive to help. These temporary jobs provide glimpses of protection-based ways of seeing, that, while not wholly new or foreign to the rebel group members (many are doting, if often absent, fathers) are new in terms of how they make those concerns into a source of a livelihood. As such this paper tempers the literature on stuck youth, and stuck armed group members in particular, reminding of the things that are changing, specifically the new ways of thinking and doing that, while not necessarily transforming armed group members’ social status, nevertheless alter these men’s everyday, such as via encouraging and monetizing that masculine version of care, coaching.

### **Brothers in Islam: Faith, Love and Care among Muslim Men in Brazil**

Gisele Fonseca Chagas

Fluminense Federal University

The Muslim presence in Brazil has been associated with distinct historical moments, dating back to the arrival of the “Mouriscos” from Portugal in the sixteenth century, African Muslim slaves in the eighteenth century, and the various waves of Arab migration in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Although the majority of the Muslim communities in Brazil is composed by Arabic-speaking immigrants from the Middle East (Syria, Lebanon, Palestine) and their descendants, there is a growing number of Brazilians without Arab background who convert to Islam. These communities have a very diversified sociological composition, ranging from the Islamic branches they belong, their ethnic identities and institutions, and the ways in which they shape their visibility in local, national and transnational levels. There is a flourishing anthropological literature

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

---

on Islam in Brazil focusing on those various historical, social and cultural elements which frame the Muslims' religious identities and experiences in the local arenas of everyday life. However, little attention has been given to the role that gender dynamics plays in this process, except for some works on Muslim women and the "hijab question". Therefore, this paper aims to go a step forward in this discussion by analyzing the intersections between religion and gender through exploring how conceptions of masculinities are elaborated, mobilized and practiced by Muslim men in Brazil. In order to address this question, the paper will focus on the ways in which Muslim men construct their religious identities and collective belongings through the notions of love, intimacy and care related to their families and to their friends – their "brothers in Islam". This study relies on fieldwork I have been conducting in Muslim communities in Brazil in different periods between 2005 and 2015.

### **"We Take Care of Our Sons": Love, Care and Companionship among Muslim Men Engaged in *Da'wa* Activities in Barcelona, Spain**

Guillermo Martín-Sáiz

Washington University in St. Louis.

This paper focuses on relationships of love and care among Muslim men engaged in *da'wa* activities in Barcelona, Spain. In particular, I address how Muslims of diverse origin draw on South Asian Islamic traditions, from Shah Waliullah to the Deobandi School, to set up forms of companionate responsibility between master and disciple. For several reasons, this proselytizing and its representation in local public life are predominantly masculine. First, the participants themselves often segregate between men and women in terms of space, leadership or audience. Second, many of these Muslims are labor migrants living in the city without their families and wives, who remain in their countries of origin. Third, political patterns of representation of Muslims in Spain reinforce the segregation of genders and the almost exclusive presence of male leadership in public. However, in the case I approach here, male predominance does not involve an exclusive performance of Muslim masculine values. In the absence of women, masters assume values of both fatherhood and motherhood and develop an ambiguous relationship of love and care towards their disciples. Paradoxically, segregation gives way to a dynamic form of performing and understanding gender values that challenges common representations of Muslim masculinity in public debates in Spain.

### ***Ghassal Ghurbat*: Solidarity, Respect, and Devotion among Muslim Men Caring for the Migrant Dead in Greece**

Tina Palivos

Yale University

In the tumultuous context of rapidly changing political, cultural, and economic conditions in Athens, Greece, Muslim refugee and migrant men struggle to ensure the rituals for caring for the dead are followed for those among them who die abroad. This work is based on ethnographic research from 2013-2016 in Athens, Greece among Muslim men from several countries including

---

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

Pakistan, Afghanistan, Nigeria, Sudan, and Egypt. Through several case studies, this paper explores the ritual practices, the personal sentiments, and the collective sense of religious obligation that Muslim men from various cultural backgrounds experience in their efforts to care for the dead in Athens, where there are no Muslim cemeteries. Muslim men in their various communities find ways to raise the funds necessary to prepare the bodies of deceased friends, families, and strangers for the repatriation of remains to the country of origin. To do so often requires a level of care, devotion, and creativity in order to navigate the complex Greek bureaucratic system, the lack of financial means, and the risk of loss of employment. The individual responsible for the corpse must also locate and contact the family members who will receive the remains on the other side, an act that is often complicated among immigrants and refugees whose main social ties are created in Greece and may not reach back to their home country. If they are unable to establish contact with a relation abroad and-or are unable to raise the funds necessary to repatriate, most often the corpse remains in the morgue while they continue in their efforts to find a way to send it home. The widespread practice of Muslim men caring for other Muslims in Athens reveals a less frequently acknowledged compassionate side of masculinity among Muslim men.

### **Spring Comes Late: Syrian Refugee Fathers above the Arctic Circle**

Nefissa Naguib

University of Oslo

Of the approximately 10,000 Syrians who have applied for asylum in Norway, close to 2,000 made their way to Norway via the Arctic passage. "Spring Comes Late" is an attempt – an essay – to use material gathered from the Arctic region to speak about how war and displacements generate imaginings of caregiving among Syrian fathers. This ethnography has involved developing research methods appropriate to the urgent environment I was studying. For three decades I have carried out extensive and long, drawn-out fieldwork in the Middle East, which included revisiting the same field sites and the same people many times. But because of the specifics of the current situation, this ethnography is necessarily different both with respect to the length of time over which the research took place and with the impermanence field site. Indeed, I think of this as rushed fieldwork, but even so, I think it provides interesting insights into the intensity of men's interactions with their children during moments of uncertainty. I hope it contributes to helping put to rest the notion of fatherhood as a simple mechanical system consisting of slots and rules, where there is alleged to be a correspondence between the cultural order and clearly defined male practices. The discrepancies between the traditional cultural settings that people left behind when they became refugees and the new, foreign order in which they seek to situate themselves and their families is at the core here.

## Searching for Love and Test-tube Babies: Arab Refugee Men in Reproductive Exile on the Margins of Detroit

Marcia C. Inhorn

Yale University

This paper examines the reproductive health problems faced by one of America's most rapidly growing immigrant populations—namely, Arab Muslims, many of whom are resettled refugees from Middle Eastern war zones. Three major areas of health disparity face this growing immigrant population: namely, the lingering reproductive health effects of war, including severe forms of male infertility; lives of poverty in resettlement communities; and the lack of access to basic health care services in the United States, including for those who need assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) in order to conceive. Based on anthropological research carried out in Dearborn, Michigan, the so-called “capital of Arab America, this paper explores the experiences 95 Arab patients, including 55 Arab men, who were seeking medical help for their infertility at an Arab-serving in vitro fertilization (IVF) clinic. Most were war refugees from Iraq and Lebanon, or economic refugees from very poor communities in Yemen. Male infertility was the most common form of infertility among this study population, all of whom required intracytoplasmic sperm injection (ICSI), the variant of IVF designed to overcome male infertility problems. However, in America's privatized medical system—where a single cycle of ICSI costs more than \$12,000 and is rarely funded by health insurance—few Arab men in the study could ultimately access ICSI, despite their significant efforts in this regard. Indeed, in this study, Arab refugee men were active seekers of reproductive health care, often coming to IVF clinics alone, undertaking repeated rounds of semen analysis, and subjecting their bodies to hormones and painful testicular biopsies. Such male reproductive agency is rarely portrayed in anthropological studies of reproduction, or in studies of Arab Muslim men, who are generally regarded as hyper-virile, patriarchal, and oppressive. Instead, in this paper, we see Arab men who love their wives, and want to make test-tube babies with them, thereby establishing new families and lives in America. This is especially true for Iraqi refugees in the US, who are generally unable to return to a home country wracked by political violence. Yet, although Arab refugee men in this study had “diasporic dreams” of making a test-tube baby, they were stuck in a situation of “reproductive exile”—forced out of home countries by political violence and destruction of medical infrastructures, but totally unable to access IVF and ICSI services in the US, where these services are the most costly in the world. This paper will elaborate on the concept of reproductive exile, attempting to make legible the reproductive desires and stories of poor Arab refugee men, while concluding with a call for reproductive justice, in which the US joins other Western industrialized nations in offering subsidized ART services, including to Arab Muslim refugees and other immigrant communities.

## CONFERENCE PARTICIPANTS

**Gustavo Barbosa** is an anthropologist, journalist and diplomat. Dr Gustavo Barbosa holds a PhD in Anthropology from the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE). He also has an MSc in Anthropology (with Distinction) from the LSE, a MSc also in Anthropology from Museu Nacional/Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro and BScs in Diplomacy, Social Sciences and Journalism (Magna cum Laude Diploma), from Instituto Rio Branco, Universidade Federal Fluminense and Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, respectively. As a diplomat, Gustavo has been posted to Lisbon and Vancouver and acted as Deputy Consul at the Consulate General of Brazil in Beirut and Deputy Head of Mission at the Brazilian Embassy in Damascus. He also was the Deputy Head of the Division for Middle Eastern Affairs at the Brazilian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. As an anthropologist, his academic interests lie on political anthropology, (non)state-making in refugee camps, Palestinian refugees, youth, gender and masculinity. He has published a number of articles, mainly in Portuguese, in edited volumes and specialized journals.

**Aina Begim** is an economic anthropologist and a PhD candidate at the Department of Anthropology at Yale University. Aina's dissertation examines pension investments and retirement planning in postsocialist Kazakhstan. Her second project is on female postsocialist entrepreneurs. Aina received her BA degree in Psychology from Bates College and her MPhil degree in Sociocultural Anthropology from Yale University. Prior to graduate studies, Aina worked in finance and at a non-profit. At Yale, she coordinates the university-wide graduate affiliate program and serves as a Fellow at the Graduate Writing Lab.

**Andrea Chiovenda** is a research fellow in the Global Health and Social Medicine Department, Harvard Medical School. He received a PhD in anthropology from Boston University in 2015, and a MA in security studies from Georgetown University in 2009. His 18 month-long fieldwork research was conducted in south-east Afghanistan among Pashtun populations, between 2009 and 2013. It focused on the impact that strict and unforgiving cultural idioms of masculinity exerted on the psychological dynamics of a select number of male informants. Currently Andrea is working on a new project about reaching a psychodynamic understanding of personal narratives of illness in Pashtun men who have suffered, or are suffering, from psychotic episodes, and who might consequently be diagnosed with schizophrenia according to Western psychiatric standards.

**Gisele Fonseca Chagas** is Professor of Anthropology at Fluminense Federal University (Brazil), where she is also the Vice-Director of the Center for Middle East Studies (NEOM). She has written several articles in Portuguese and English based on her research on Muslim communities in Brazil and on Female Sufism in Damascus, Syria.

**Farha Ghannam** is Professor of Anthropology at Swarthmore College. She is the author of *Live and Die like a Man: Gender Dynamics in Urban Egypt* (Stanford 2013) and *Remaking the Modern: Space, Relocation, and the Politics of Identity in a Global Cairo* (California 2002). She is the co-editor of *Health and Identity in Egypt* (AUC 2004).

---

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

**Marcia C. Inhorn**, PhD, MPH, is the William K. Lanman, Jr. Professor of Anthropology and International Affairs in the Department of Anthropology and The Whitney and Betty MacMillan Center for International and Area Studies at Yale University. A specialist on Middle Eastern gender, religion, and health, Inhorn has conducted research on the social impact of infertility and assisted reproductive technologies in Egypt, Lebanon, the United Arab Emirates, and Arab America over the past 30 years. She is the author of five books on the subject, including her latest, *Cosmopolitan Conceptions: IVF Sojourns in Global Dubai* (Duke University Press, 2015). She is also the (co)editor of nine books, the founding editor of the *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* (JMEWS), and co-editor of the Berghahn Book series on "Fertility, Reproduction, and Sexuality." She has served as president of the Society for Medical Anthropology of the American Anthropological Association; on the Board of Directors of the Middle East Studies Association; and as director of Middle East centers at both Yale and University of Michigan. Inhorn has received numerous awards for her books and scholarship, including the American Anthropological Association's Robert B. Textor and Family Prize for excellence in anticipatory anthropology, the AAA's Eileen Basker and Diana Forsythe Prizes for outstanding anthropological research in gender, health, and biomedical technology, the JMEWS Book Award in Middle East gender studies, and the Middle East Distinguished Scholar award from the AAA's Middle East Section. She has also received the Graduate Mentor Award from the Society for Medical Anthropology's Student Association. Currently, Inhorn is writing a book on Arab refugee reproductive health, which is under contract with Stanford University Press. She is also conducting a two-year National Science Foundation-funded research study on oocyte cryopreservation (egg freezing) for both medical and elective fertility preservation.

**Vinay Kamat** received his PhD at Emory University and is associate professor in the Department of Anthropology, University of British Columbia. Trained as a medical anthropologist, he has conducted extensive ethnographic research in India and Tanzania. His research has focused on aspects of health, illness, and social suffering in marginalized communities. In the Tanzanian context, his research has examined the everyday lived experiences of marginalized people who are caught in a process of rapid social transformation engendered through neo-liberal economic reforms. His book *Silent Violence: Global Health, Malaria, and Child Survival in Tanzania* (2013), documents his research on malaria in Tanzania conducted over a decade. His current research examines the social impact of a marine conservation project and a natural gas development project in southeastern Tanzania, with a focus on dispossession and food security concerns among the Makonde people who inhabit the coastal villages along Tanzania's border with Mozambique.

**Diane E. King** is Associate Professor of Anthropology at the University of Kentucky, where she was first a postdoctoral fellow in the Department of History (2001-2002), and where she has been teaching since 2007. She started her career at American University of Beirut, where she was faculty in the Department of Social and Behavioral Sciences from 2000 to 2006 (except for two research leaves). Her first ethnographic field site was in Malaysia, where she carried out research on urbanization and collective identity among Malay Muslims. Her PhD is from Washington State University (2000). As an ethnographer, Dr. King is interested in everyday life in the context of the

---

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

postcolonial, the modern state, and globalization. She works on patrilineal descent and its implications for collective identity at levels ranging from the household to the “nation.” She has been working for over two decades in the Kurdistan Region of Iraq and to a lesser extent in Turkey, Syria, and Lebanon, and also with Kurdish and other Middle Eastern diasporans in the United States. She has published a number of articles and book chapters, and the edited volume *Middle Eastern Belongings* (Routledge 2010). Her monograph, *Kurdistan on the Global Stage: Kinship, Land, and Community in Iraq* was published by Rutgers University Press in 2014.

**Louisa Lombard** is an Assistant Professor of Anthropology at Yale University. Previously she was a Ciriacy-Wantrup Postdoctoral Fellow in Natural Resource Economics at the University of California at Berkeley. She earned her PhD in Cultural Anthropology from Duke University. Her research focuses on African borderland areas where the state is largely absent, and a range of actors govern. Her research locales are further marked by violent histories that continue into the present: how, in such contexts, do people navigate fragile relationships of trust and claim access to resources and authority? She is the co-editor of *Making Sense of the Central African Republic*, and is currently completing two book manuscripts, *Hunting Game: Politics in a Central African Frontier* and *State of Rebellion: Violence and Intervention in the Central African Republic* (expected 2016). Her articles have been published in the Journal of the Royal Anthropological Society, African Affairs, Geoforum, the Political and Legal Anthropology Review, the Journal of Contemporary African Studies, and others.

**Guillermo Martín-Sáiz** is a PhD Student of Anthropology at Washington University in St. Louis. His research project begins in Spain and explores the way in which the Islamic movement Tablighi Jama'at deals with the shortage of spaces for preaching and gatherings. Specifically, he addresses how itinerant preaching shapes forms of religious authority and transmission of knowledge that alternative/parallel to those within madrasas and mosques. Thus, his interests oscillate between the anthropology of religion and studies and debates on language, publics and mediation.

**Nefissa Naguib** is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Oslo. She has for many years researched, written and talked about moments of rupture—cultural, historical, and political—in the contemporary world and, how, in response to these ruptures, people make sense of loss and change. Her interest lies in the broader political economies, political conjunctures, and historical trajectories shaping particular local situations and everyday living. Her most recent book, *Nurturing Masculinities: Men, Food and Family in Contemporary Egypt*, is a contribution to the anthropology of masculinities and to food ethnography.

**Mari Norbakk** is a PhD candidate at the Department of Social Anthropology at the University of Bergen. Her PhD project is about divergent commemorative practices in Egypt's Suez Canal Zone – with a particular focus on ideas of male heroism and memories of war in everyday life. Norbakk has worked on gender in the Middle East, and in 2014 completed her Master's thesis titled “Love and Responsibility: An Ethnography of Masculinities and Marriage in Urban Egypt”. She is currently involved in a Chr. Michelsen Institute (CMI) project on women friendly law reform in Muslim contexts, where she is leading a case study on Tunisian family law and implementation of the

---

Muslim Men: On Love, Nurturance, Care, and Fulfillment

2014 constitution. She is also involved in the CMI project “Everyday Maneuvers: Military-Civilian Relations in Latin America and the Middle East”, funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, where she has done research on museums and monuments dedicated to the wars over the Suez Canal.

**Tina Palivos** is currently a PhD Candidate in Anthropology at Yale University. Since 2013, she has resided in Athens, Greece where she conducted ethnographic research among Muslim migrants and refugees on the subjects of death, migration, and Islam, which was partially funded by a National Science Foundation Dissertation Improvement Grant. She is currently writing her dissertation, which will be completed within the next year. Tina also holds a BA in Anthropology and French Studies from the University of Michigan, an MA in Anthropology and Modern Greek Studies from San Francisco State University and has conducted research on issues of migration policy and human rights in Greece, the European Union, and several regions in Africa and the Middle East for the past ten years.

**Gauri Pathak** is a medical anthropologist who received her PhD from the School of Anthropology, University of Arizona. Prior to moving into anthropology, she completed a BBA in Management and an MA in South Asian Studies, both from the National University of Singapore. She has also worked in advertising and editing. Her research focuses on the body and health in globalizing urban India, including structural vulnerabilities and metabolic syndrome disorders and the changing relationship between the body and middle-class subjectivity in India after economic liberalization. Her current research focus is an ethnographic examination of human-plastic interactions in urban India in the context of the downstream human and ecological health effects of these interactions.

**Nancy J. Smith-Hefner** is Associate Professor in the Department of Anthropology at Boston University. She has written extensively on issues of language, gender, education, and sexuality in Southeast Asia. Her recent publications include “The New Muslim Romance: Changing Patterns of Courtship and Marriage Among Educated Javanese Youth” (In *Islam in Southeast Asia*, edited by Joseph Chinyong Liow and N. Hosen, 2010); “‘Hypersexed’ Youth and the New Muslim Sexology in Contemporary Java” (*Review of Indonesian and Malay Affairs*, 2009); “Women, Language Shift, and Ideologies of Self in Indonesia” (*Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 2009); “Youth Language, Gaul Sociability, and the New Indonesian Middle Class” (*Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 2007); “Muslim Women and the Veil in Post-Soeharto Java” (*Journal of Asian Studies*, 2007); and “Reproducing Respectability: Sex and Sexuality among Muslim Javanese Youth” (RIMA, 2006). She is currently completing a book manuscript entitled *Islamizing Intimacy: Gender, Youth, and Social Change in Contemporary Java*.